REPORT

OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSIONS ON THE EVALUATION OF TRAINING-METHODOLOGICAL CENTER

PSE on REM "Higher Medical College" of the Public Health Department of Almaty city

FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE STANDARDS OF INSTITUTIONAL ACCREDITATION OF ORGANIZATIONS OF ADDITIONAL EDUCATION (CONTINUING PROFESSIONAL DEVELOPMENT)

The period of the external expert evaluation: 25.11.-27.11.2020 year

1. Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with the order of the ECA No. 19 of 13.11.2020, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct a specialized accreditation of the Public state enterprise with the rights of economic management "Higher Medical College" of the Public Health Department of the City of Almaty (hereinafter referred to as the College) in the following composition from 25 to 17 November 2020:



Chairman of the External Expert Commission AMANZHOLOVA TATIANA KADYROVNA, Deputy Director for Practical Training, NUO "Kazakh-Russian Higher Medical College"



Foreign expert

The foreign expert
POZDEYEVA TATYANA VASILYEVNA,
MD, Professor, Head of the Department of
Economics, Management and Medical Law
Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, Preventive Medicine
and the Faculty of Higher Nursing Education
Federal State Budgetary Educational Institution of
Higher Education "Privolzhsky Research Medical
University", Ministry of Health of the Russian
Federation, Nizhny Novgorod



National Academic Expert
KHALYKOVA MADINA BAKYTZHANOVNA,
Master in Public Health,
Director of the Department of Continuing Education
JSC "Kazakh Medical University of
continuing education"



National Academic Expert
ABZHANOVA ZHANAR SOLTANOVNA,
Deputy Director for Scientific and Methodological
work
LLP "Republican Higher Medical College"



National Academic Expert
KOLBAEV MEYERBEK TOLEGENOVICH,
Master of Medicine, General Practitioner,
Chief Specialist of simulation center,
NJSC "Kazakh National Medical University named after S. D. Asfendiyarov"



National Academic Expert
ZASKALKO EKATERINA EVGENIEVNA,
methodologist of the methodical cabinet
Public state enterprise "Kostanay Higher Medical
College" of the Health Department of the Akimat of
Kostanay region



Expert - representative of employers
TERTUBAEVA ZHAZIRA ORUMBEKOVNA,
Head of the Department of Strategic Development,
Human Resources and Functional Support,
"International Institute of Postgraduate Education"
LLP, Almaty



Expert - representative of listeners
DAULETOVA KAMAR SAMALBEKOVNA,
Chief Nurse of the PSE on the REM "Republican
Scientific and Practical Center for Mental Health" of
the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan



Expert - student representative4th year student of the Faculty of "Medical Science" of the Kazakh-Russian Higher Medical College in Almaty



ECAQA Observer
UMAROVA MAKPAL ALDIBEKOVNA
Head of the Accreditation and Monitoring
Department, NU " Eurasian Centre for Accreditation
and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and
Health care "

tel :: +77475609212, e-mail:info@ecaqa.org

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulations on the EEC (Order of the ECAQA Director General No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

2. General part of the final report of the EEC

2.1 Representation of the PSE on the REM "Higher Medical College" of the Public Health Department of the city of Almaty and the training and simulation center

In pursuance of the Resolution of the Board of the Health Department of the city of Almaty dated May 23, 2016 No. 181, in order to organize and coordinate activities for the training, advanced training and retraining of medical personnel, improving human resources, professional development of medical workers of healthcare organizations in the city of Almaty, guided by the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On Administrative Procedures", the Regulations on the Department of Health of the city of Almaty, by order of the Department of Health of the city of Almaty dated May 23, 2016. No. 181 on the basis of the SPE on the REM (State-owned public enterprise with the rights of economic management) "Medical College" of the Health Department of the city of Almaty, the "Training and Methodological Center" (hereinafter - the EMC) was created.

The EMC PSE on the REM "Higher Medical College" of the Public Health Administration (hereinafter referred to as the PHA) of Almaty organizes and coordinates activities to improve the qualifications and retraining of healthcare personnel, train specialists abroad and with the involvement of foreign specialists in priority areas of activity. The activities of the EMC are carried out under the direct supervision of the PHA in Almaty.

Control over the activities of the educational center is carried out by the PHA of Almaty on an ongoing basis in the form of an audit of financial activities, a current assessment of the quality of training of students, the quality of methodological work in primary health care, with the adoption of annual college development plans.

The EMC operates a simulation center (17 mannequins and phantoms, 4 of them are computerized), a center for the protection of mothers and children and a department of additional education.

Since the day of the operation of the EMC, the teaching staff have developed professional development programmes for doctors in the amount of 29, of which: for GP doctors - 16; for obstetricians-gynecologists - 8; for anesthesiologists-resuscitators - 1; for doctors of ambulance station - 2; for neonatologists - 2.

For paramedical workers - 58, of which: for m / s of PHC - 11; for paramedics - 12; for general practitioners - 25, for midwives of maternity hospitals and antenatal clinics - 9; for m / s of departments of newborns - 1.

Currently, 88 additional education programmes are being implemented (professional development programmes, certification cycles, master classes, trainings, seminars), including 29 for doctors, 58 for SMW, and -1 for paramedics.

The training is carried out by 40 teachers, including 29 people with an academic degree, 27 with the highest medical category, 3 with the first medical category, and 4 certified international trainers.

In total, 7 495 doctors, 11 669 SMW were trained during the work of the EMC, paramedics were not trained.

The achievement of the EMC of the republican level can be considered the victories of the specialists of the teams of the ambulance doctors' teams in 2017 at the republican competitions in Astana (1st place), trained at the EMC, and also 6 specialists (doctors, paramedics) took 3rd place.

2.2 Information on previous accreditation

Educational programmes of additional education of the Educational and Methodological Center of the PSE on the REM "Higher Medical College" of the Department of Public Health of the city of Almaty have not been accredited to date.

2.3 Analysis of the report on self-assessment of educational programmes of additional education of the Educational and Methodological Center of the PSE on the REM "Higher Medical College" of the Department of Public Health of the city of Almaty for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of Continuing Education Programmes of Medical Educational Organizations (continuing professional development)

Report on self-esteem educational programmes of additional education of the Educational and Methodological Center is presented on 169 pages of the main text, applications on 60 pages, including on the electronic resource.

The report is characterized by the completeness of answers to all 9 accreditation standards, structuredness, taking into account the recommendations of the Guidelines for self-assessment of medical educational organizations, as well as the internal unity of the information provided by the college. The report is accompanied by an accompanying a letter signed by director Sultangazieva Svetlana Eleusizovna, confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report contains a list of 8 members of the internal self-assessment commission indicating the responsibility of each employee, information about the representative of the organization responsible for conducting the specialized self-assessment Roza Nurmanovna Zhundabekova. The chairman of the

working group on preparation for specialized accreditation is Aida Gamzaevna Imasheva, head of the Training and Methodological Center.

Self-assessment of educational programmes of additional education of the Training and Methodological Center was carried out on the basis of the order No. 028-n/k "On conducting specialized accreditation of additional education programmes" dated 04/13/2020. The working group on the preparation of the self-assessment report has done a certain amount of work: the goals and objectives for the implementation of educational programmes of CPD have been analyzed, the necessary information has been collected in accordance with the Standards for the accreditation of continuing education programmes for medical educational organizations (continuing professional development) (hereinafter referred to as the ECAQA Accreditation Standards); a thorough analysis, updating and addition of methodological and educational materials was carried out, their content is reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards and includes a description of the strengths, areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards.

The experts determined that the educational center organizes advanced training and retraining of working medical and non-medical specialists of state health organizations in Almaty in 50 programmes and it is planned for 33 programmes of different duration. The advanced training of medical personnel, carried out at the EMC, is divided into 3 forms of training: organization of advanced training of medical personnel within the country with the involvement of leading domestic specialists in the field; organization of advanced training of medical personnel by attracting leading foreign specialists in Almaty and conducting training seminars (master classes); organization of professional development of specialists by sending them to foreign educational organizations and / or clinical centers.

The database, applications on 60 pages, are presented in full, sequentially and there are links to them in the text of the report. The report is written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text and are consecutively numbered.

3. Conclusion on external expert evaluation

External expert work on the assessment of educational programmes of additional education of the Training and Methodological Center (Appendix No. 3) was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the external assessment of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA and according to the programme of the visit to the college, approved on November 19, 2020 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbaeva S.S. and agreed with the director S.E. Sultangazieva.

Results of the questionnaire survey of the EMC students

The Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care (ECAQA) applied an online survey on the resource https://webanketa.com/ In total, the proposed questionnaire contains 22 questions, including an assessment of satisfaction with training and resources of the organization. The total number of listeners on the list is 14. The total number of respondents is 14. More than 71% of the respondents were students of professional development programmes, more than 28% of retraining programmes.

They will recommend to study in this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, relatives - 100% completely agree. Programme managers and teachers are aware of the problems of the students - 100% completely agree. 92.8% are satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms and classrooms of the educational center. Almost 93% are fully satisfied with access to electronic educational resources, and 7.1% are partially satisfied. All of the interviewed participants (100%) were fully satisfied with the organization of clinical training, teaching and assessment methods, and the schedule of classes at the EMC. In the classroom, teachers use active teaching methods in the opinion of almost 93% regularly, in the opinion of 7.14% - sometimes. More than 92.85% of the respondents assessed the work of the EEC as positive. Almost 93% of respondents believe that accreditation of an educational organization is necessary.

Output. The ECAQA External expert commission should pay attention to the availability of clinical site resources to trainees.

Results of a survey of teachers of the educational and methodological center

In total, the proposed questionnaire contains 21 questions, including an assessment of satisfaction with the organization of the educational process, conditions for teachers and resources of the organization. The total number of teachers on the list is 20. The total number of respondents is 19.

Teaching experience of the respondents - up to 5 years - 16%, 5-10 years - 21%, over 10 years - 63.2%. Satisfied with the organization of the educational process in this educational institution - 100%. At the EMC, ethics and subordination are observed in relations between colleagues, teachers, management - 100%. Satisfied with the organization of work and workplace in this educational organization - 89.5% in full, 10.53% in part. In college there is an opportunity for career growth and development of teacher competencies - 89.5% in full, 10.53% in part. More than 89.5% have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish research results.

Output. The ECAQA external expert commission should pay attention to the awareness of teachers in their support and development programmes.

EEC conclusions on external expert commission

As part of an external expert assessment of the Educational and Methodological Center for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards, members of the EEC carefully studied and assessed the main indicators of the educational activities of the college and the educational programme.

The information received by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, interviews with management, employees of departments (table 1), study of documentation, during interviews with 15 administrative workers, interviews with 12 teachers, 4 employers, and a survey of 14 students of CPD programmes, 20 teachers, including 15 part-time workers. All information received was compared with the data of the self-assessment report, which made it possible to ensure the reliability and validation of the information provided by the college and supporting documents for compliance with the above-mentioned ECAQA Accreditation Standards.

During the external expert commission by the EEC members, in addition to the 10 documents previously viewed, 33 documents were additionally requested (Appendix # 2) and video materials on training resources, which made it possible to identify the compliance of the educational organization's activities with ECAQA accreditation standards.

Recommendations for improving the educational programmes of additional education at the EMC, developed by the EEC based on the results of the expert assessment, were presented at a meeting with the management of the college on November 27, 2020.

On the last day of the visit, the members of the EEC assessed the educational programmes of additional education of the EMC according to the developed ECAQA "Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of educational programmes of additional education for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards" (Appendix # 1). The above document was individually completed by each member of the EEC. No comments were made by the EEC members.

The programme and schedule of the external expert evaluation of the EEC has been completed in full. On the part of the college staff, the participation of all persons indicated in the programme is ensured.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the report on self-assessment of educational programmes of continuing education of the EMC in full in accordance with the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for external assessment of the medical education organization of ECAQA.

For the work of EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all the necessary information and material resources was organized. The commission notes the high level of corporate culture of the college, the high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the Training and Methodological Center and an overview of strengths for each standard

Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES

The mission of the center is *Ensuring the implementation of the policy of training highly qualified health professionals based on the principles of continuing development*". *The* mission and vision of the EMC were considered and approved at a meeting of the methodological council of the college on 05/25/2020 (protocol No. 8 of 05/25/2020).

The management of the college, the staff of the EMC, teachers who are members of professional associations, representatives from employers took an active part in the development of the EMC mission.

The mission and vision are available for familiarization to employees, listeners, and other interested persons by posting on the EMC website https / medcollege1.wixsite.com / umcalmaty, at the information stands of the center. For employees of the organization, the mission was communicated at the meeting. The mission is displayed on the website, in syllables, booklets, social networks (instagram @ umc.almaty). When consulting health professionals, the focus is primarily on the mission; at the beginning of the training, trainers and teachers discuss with the audience.

Based on the analysis of the needs of practical healthcare in the country and in Almaty (stable indicators of infant and maternal mortality; dominance of diseases of the circulatory system, including the causes of mortality; perinatal conditions), EMC teachers have developed programmes, some of which are implemented on the basis of simulations. For example, programmes such as: Providing emergency medical care at the pre-hospital stage using simulation technologies; Safe motherhood and emergency care in obstetrics and gynecology; Principles of Basic Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation; Practical skills in newborn resuscitation; Universal progressive model of patronage service - UPM.

The analysis of the needs of healthcare professionals resulted in the introduction of training with the involvement of foreign specialists from India, Canada and Lithuania on such programmes as: "Improvement and continuity of all stages of rehabilitation" master class with the involvement of foreign specialists (India); "Creation of a multi-disciplinary team in the management of chronic respiratory diseases" master class with the involvement of foreign experts (Canada); "Safe motherhood and organization of emergency care in obstetrics and neonatology at the outpatient level" (Lithuania). Educational programmes with the involvement of foreign specialists are reviewed and approved by the PHA commission.

Strengths:

- 1. The EMC is a leader in additional education for mid-level medical specialists in Almaty.
- 2. The financial stability of the center is due to targeted funding from the Akimat of Almaty
- 3. Taking into account the subordination of the EMC SHI in Almaty, the center responds in a mobile manner to the needs of the city in training.

EEC conclusions by criteria. correspond from 12 standards: completely - 10, significantly - 2, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 1: established that Standard 1 meets the criteria for institutional accreditation.

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) Bring the mission to the freelance trainers.

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMMES

The implementation of additional education programmes of the Center is carried out in accordance with a regulatory framework in the field of health care and education.

In each educational programme, taking into account the requirements of training, the goals and objectives of the discipline, the end results of training are clearly reflected, the topics and the number of hours allocated for lectures, practical, seminars and IWS are determined, the basic and additional literature used is indicated. After completing the advanced training course, the cadets understand that all achievements in practical health care have a scientific, evidence-based basis.

The center implements additional education on educational programmes for advanced training of practical health care professionals with higher medical education, specialists with secondary medical education in the specialty "Nursing", "Medical care (paramedic, midwife), as well as with the involvement of specialists from near and far abroad. ...

In total, the EMC has developed 46 educational programmes in 5 clusters: professional development programmes with a volume of 108 hours -23, a volume of 54 hours -22, certification trainings with a volume of 18 hours -1, with the involvement of foreign specialists, 7 educational programmes were developed in the amount of 54 hours of them for SMW-1 programme.

Educational programmes are designed in accordance with international standards, taking into account the wishes of practical healthcare.

Strengths:

- 1) compliance of the content of CPD programmes with the requirements of TC, ensuring the breadth and depth of training of students in accordance with the name of the programme and specialty;
- 2) a wide range of disciplines being implemented, adapted to the requirements of legal acts, innovations.
 - 3) availability of clinical sites;
- 4) EMC uses appropriate teaching and learning methods, guarantees the integration of components in practice and theory, experience in providing patient care, independent and active learning, implement programmes based on the principles of quality, equality, provides students with both academic knowledge and the necessary skills that can affect their personal development and can be applied in their future careers, ensures integration between education and health care;

EEC conclusions by criteria. They correspond from 19 standards: completely -18, significantly -1, partially -0, do not correspond -0.

Standard 2: meets the criteria for institutional accreditation

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Expand access to foreign databases, as well as to the resources of international partners.
- 2) Consider the possibility of improving the language (foreign languages) training of students, incl. on electronic resources

Standard 3: ASSESSMENT AND DOCUMENTATION

Approaches to assessing the knowledge and skills of students are reflected in the "Regulations on the organization of the educational process". Teachers and instructors develop an assessment system, these are checklists, situational tasks, test tasks approved at meetings of the Methodological Council. The form of control is determined by the teachers independently.

For the objectivity of the assessment system, the center introduced a system of attending classes by the heads of the methodological department. "Checklist Analysis of the attended lesson" with the results of the attended lessons is formed immediately after the lesson. Responsibility for the formation and implementation of the policy for evaluating students of additional education programmes lies with the instructors, teachers and methodologists who are part of the method of the council.

Students of retraining programmes and professional development programmes conduct regular self-assessment, including an analysis of how the student is ready to assess the initial level of knowledge, what skill he acquired or improved upon completing the study of a specific topic or section of the discipline.

The office work of the EMC is carried out in accordance with the requirements of the Order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On approval of the Rules for advanced training and retraining of medical and pharmaceutical personnel" No. 691 dated November 11, 2009 and the order of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On approval of the Model rules for the activities of educational organizations of the corresponding types" No. 595 dated October 30, 2018.

Instructors and teachers form a thematic portfolio both in electronic format and on paper, consisting of didactic material, updated diagnostic and treatment protocols and algorithms for providing

medical care, a bibliographic list of literature, test questions and situational tasks. The quality of the portfolio content is monitored by a methodological advice.

Strengths:

- 1) Compliance of the final competencies of the EMC programmes with the requirements of standard training programmes and retraining of medical and pharmaceutical personnel.
- 2) A transparent procedure for assessing educational achievements at all stages of the student's preparation

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria conform from 8 standards: completely - 7, significantly - 1, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 3: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) It is recommended to use the programme "Antiplagiat" for the examination of written works

Standard 4: THE HEALTHCARE PROFESSIONALS

All the necessary conditions are created for the students of the Center, contributing to the satisfaction of educational and personal needs. Taking into account the direct subordination of the college to the Health Department of Almaty, stable partnerships have been formed with the heads of medical organizations.

The formation of the contingent of students of educational programmes of additional education is carried out on the basis of a personal statement of the student or a petition of a medical or other sending / receiving organization with confirmation of the availability of the appropriate professional education and specialty. When organizing training cycles, each health care professional is responsible for his participation in training, contracts are concluded with a medical organization / individual, which spell out the rights and obligations of the student / organization.

In the EMC, stimulation of specialists consists in the flexibility of the schedule, the flexibility of the educational process, training within the framework of the state order from the local budget, training can be organized upon request, focused on the profile of the specialist, the specifics of the organization. The specialists trained at the center pass the certification exam 100%.

Strengths:

- 1. Transparency of the selection procedure and equality of access to additional education:
- 2. Flexible procedure of the educational process, taking into account the strict schedule of students.
- 3. Constant consulting support for students, including individual;

EEC conclusions by criteria. out of 17 standards: fully - 16, significantly - 1, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 4: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Actively stimulate students to form their own educational trajectory
- 2) Develop a regulatory document to stimulate the individual participation of practical healthcare professionals in CPD with subsequent implementation in the educational process

Standard 5: CPD PROVISION

Additional education programmes have been implemented by the EMC since 2016 after the opening of the center on the basis of the HMC PHA in Almaty. The Higher Medical College passed in 2019 the institutional accreditation of the Medical College in ECAQA.

Training in additional education programmes is carried out in accordance with requirements MoH RK order of November 11, 2009 No. 691 "On approval of the Rules for advanced training and retraining of medical and pharmaceutical personnel, as well as qualification requirements for organizations implementing programmes of additional medical and pharmaceutical education" and implement both formal and non-formal forms of education.

The staff of the center implementing additional education programmes is represented by graduate teachers or having the highest / first category in their specialty, work experience on the profile of the specialty at least 3 years and teaching experience at least 1 year.

The EMC has developed and operates corporate culture tools. Great importance is attached to the transparency, intelligibility and predictability of the actions of managers, collegiality in making managerial decisions, democracy and ethics in resolving labor conflicts.

EMC successfully develops cooperation with partner universities in the far and near abroad on the issues of professional development of health care professionals both in the workplace and training abroad. Doctors-instructors of the Center have undergone special training in simulation centers in Israel, Lithuania and other countries, have international trainer certificates. Foreign experts were invited to conduct master classes for further training of specialists on the basis of the EMC.

The forms and content of additional education programmes are coordinated by the administration and teachers of the EMC and CMC with the relevant authorities (medical organizations, the Health Department) so that health professionals, after completing their training, can possess the necessary competencies.

Strengths:

- 1) The staff of the center, the availability of trainers with international certificates,
- 2) Flexible form of training, with the ability to organize training at the place of work of students,

EEC conclusions by criteria. Correspond from 12 standards: completely -12, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 5: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: not

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

For the organization of educational activities, the EMC has training rooms with a total area of 2144.1 sq. m, located on the 6,5,4 floors of the Higher Medical College. The classroom fund includes 8 training simulation rooms, a debriefing room, 12 classrooms, a computer testing room.

8 simulation rooms, with a total area of 350.7 m2 are equipped with modern mannequins, phantoms and dummies for students to acquire practical skills. The instructors of the simulation center monitor the observance of the safety rules, industrial sanitation and fire protection by the trainees during the classes at the simulation center.

To conduct the practical part of the classes, the EMC concluded contracts with 6 clinical bases for the implementation of a number of additional education programmes.

Students of the EMC use information sources (textbooks, teaching aids, teaching aids and developments in academic disciplines, active handouts and instructions for independent work), there is access to the book fund of the NJSC "Kazakh National Medical University named after S. D. Asfendiyarov, where workplaces were provided in the electronic library with access to the resources of Pubmed, Scopus, Medline, DynaMed, Webofknowledge, Cochranelibrary.

The teachers of the center actively use distance technologies to conduct classes. Technical support is provided by both the staff of the center and the specialists of the IT department of the college.

The EMC uses a multidisciplinary approach to training in continuing education programmes.

Strengths:

Availability of the necessary resources to provide competitive educational programmes in demand.

- 2) Collaboration with stakeholders and organizations.
- 3) Joint cooperation and exchange of experience with foreign centers.
- 4) Has sufficient equipment for MTB.
- 5) Long-term partnership with budget organizations

EEC conclusions by criteria. out of 24 standards: fully - 22, significantly - 2, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 6: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

- 1) Expand the access of listeners to professional literature, incl. to international electronic databases of literature
- 2) Develop a regulatory document to encourage cooperation of students with colleagues (for example, in the rules on the organization of educational

Standard 7: EVALUATION OF CPD ACTIVITIES

The EMC has a continuous mechanism for internal quality assessment and examination of additional education programmes, which provides control over the implementation of the curriculum and the tasks set, as well as feedback for their improvement. The mechanism and procedure for monitoring programmes is implemented by the Methodological Council. The monitoring results are available to all interested parties: the center and college management, students, service consumers. A prerequisite is the updating of curricula every 5 years, taking into account the new normative documents of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

In order to assess the effectiveness of training programmes, constant monitoring of students' opinions (questionnaires) about the training programme is carried out upon completion of training. The opinion of students is considered as an assessment of experts who are able to objectively assess the curriculum according to the proposed criteria (indicators). Students are usually asked to complete specially designed questionnaires upon completion of training. Based on the results of the questionnaire, appropriate measures and recommendations are developed aimed at improving educational programmes and organizing the educational process.

Strengths:

- 1) An effective structure for managing the educational process and evaluating educational programmes.
- 2) Positive feedback from healthcare organizations on the high-quality level of preschool education.
 - 3) Participation of teachers in the formation and monitoring of educational programmes.

EEC conclusions by criteria. from 11 standards: completely -11, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 7: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: not

Standard 8: ORGANISATION

The administration of the HMC PHA of Almaty and the head of the educational center ensure the proper management of educational programmes of the CPD. For this, the structure of the EMC has appropriate employees, directly or indirectly involved in the solution of training issues and structures involved in the organization, planning, monitoring and analysis.

The financial and economic activity of the EMC is aimed at ensuring financial stability and solvency for its obligations, at increasing income, stability of wages, strengthening the material and technical base and is carried out in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Teachers from among the employees of the educational center are provided material assistance, incentives are provided to introduce innovations into the educational process.

Strengths:

- 1) Continuous organizational, coordination and administrative work aimed at achieving the mission and goals;
- 2) Responsibilities and obligations regarding the management of the educational programme are defined;
 - 3) Stable financial condition of the Center

EEC conclusions by criteria. out of 9 standards: completely - 9, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: not

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS RENEWAL

The educational center has developed and operates a system for monitoring the quality of preparation of educational and methodological documentation, including the content of educational programmes. Every year, the educational and methodological department of the center checks the state of methodological support of all educational programmes of teachers, taking into account changes in international standards, RLA RK, standard training programmes, clinical protocols for diagnosis and treatment of RK and is approved by the Methodical Council of the EMC.

The college and center management allocate all the necessary resources to continuously improve the CPD programmes. Taking into account the changing needs of society, updates to international standards, regulations, clinical protocols, teachers and trainers of the EMC are introducing new teaching methods, such as work in small groups, lectures, seminars, practical exercises, debriefing methodology, 15 basic and most popular educational concepts related to with modern innovative information technologies.

Strengths:

- 1) Decent pay for teachers, trainers and EMC staff;
- 2) Specialists trained in the EMC can express their opinion by passing a questionnaire and commenting on social networks;
- 3) The educational process carried out at the Center "Innovation" is aimed at developing professional responsibility, clinical skills, knowledge and skills among specialists, striving for constant self-improvement, continuing professional development;
- 4) The management promptly resolves material issues related to ensuring the safety of employees and finding trainees

EEC conclusions by criteria. They correspond from 6 standards: completely - 6, significantly -0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 9: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit: not

Thus, all 9 accreditation standards have been met, no inconsistencies in the fulfillment of the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analyzing the self-assessment report and conducting the examination as part of the tasks of the external peer review programme were found.

5. Recommendations for the improvement of the Educational and Methodological Center of the PSE on the REM "Higher Medical College" of the Public Health Department of the city of Almaty:

- 1. Provide EMC teachers with information on internal regulatory documentation in order to improve the educational process.
- 2. Expand access to foreign databases and resources of foreign partners of the EMC.
- 3. Consider the possibility of improving the linguistic (foreign languages) training of students, incl. using electronic resources.
- 4. Introduce the "Antiplagiat" programme for conducting examinations of students' written works.
- 5. To develop a regulatory document to stimulate the individual participation of practical healthcare professionals in CPD with subsequent implementation in the educational process (for example, making an addition to the current GNI Rules on the organization of the educational process).
- 6. Develop a regulatory document to encourage student cooperation for multidisciplinary learning.
- 7. Recommendations for the design of the EMC website:

- Simplify the navigation on the college website, providing a quick transition to the EMC website.
- Regularly update the site information in accordance with the current documents (for example, international cooperation).

7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Council

Members of the EEC came to the unanimous opinion to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit educational programmes for additional education (continuing professional development) according to the list in Annex of educational and methodological center PSE on REM "Higher medical College" Department of public health of the city of Almaty for the period of 5 (five) years.

Chairman of the External Expert Commission

Amanzholova Tatyana Kadyrovna

The foreign expert

Pozdeyeva Tatyana Vasilyevna

National Academic Expert

Halykova Madina Bakytzhanova

National Academic Expert

Abzhanova Zhanar Soltanovna

National Academic Expert

Kolbaev Mairbek Tolegenovich

National Academic Expert

Zaskalko Ekaterina Evgenievna

Expert-representative of employers

Turdubaeva Zhazira Oralbekovna

Expert listener

Dauletova Kamar Zamanbekovna

Expert of students

Levashova Anastasia Mikhailovna

The ECAQA observer

Umarov Makpal Aldibekova

Attachment # 1.

Quality profile and external evaluation criteria

Standa rd	Criteria for evaluation		Assessment			
ra		Number of standards = BS*/SU	Fully complies	Significantly corresponds	Fully complies	Does not match
1	MISSION AND OUTCOMES	12 = 8/4	10	2		
2.	EDUCATIONAL	19 = 10/9	18	1		
	PROGRAMME					
3.	ASSESSMENT AND	8 = 6/2	7	1		
	DOCUMENTATION					
4.	THE HEALTHCARE	17 = 11 /6	16	1		
	PROFESSIONALS					
5.	CPD PROVISION	12 = 5/7	12			
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	24 = 12/12	22	2		
7.	EVALUATION OF CPD	11 = 6/5	11			
	ACTIVITIES					
8.	ORGANISATION	9 = 5/4	9			
9.	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	6 = 3/3	6			
	Total:	118 =	111	7		
		66 BS / 51SU				
		_	118			